The Gulf of Mexico ecosystem, six years after the Macondo oil well blowout

Samantha B. Joye a,*, Annalisa Bracco b, Tamay M. Özgökmen c, Jeffrey P. Chanton d, Martin Grosell e, Ian R. MacDonald d, Erik E. Cordes e, Joseph P. Montoya f, Uta Passow g

a Department of Marine Sciences, University of Georgia, Athens, GA 30602-3636, USA
b School of Earth and Atmospheric Sciences, Georgia Institute of Technology, Atlanta, GA 30332, USA
c Rosenstiel School of Marine and Atmospheric Science, University of Miami, Miami, FL 33149, USA
d Department of Earth, Ocean and Atmospheric Science, Florida State University, Tallahassee, FL 32306, USA
e Department of Biology, Temple University, Philadelphia, PA 19122, USA
f College of Marine Sciences, University of South Florida, St. Petersburg, FL 33701, USA
g Marine Science Institute, University of California, Santa Barbara, CA 93106, USA

A R T I C L E   I N F O

Article history:
Received 27 April 2016
Accepted 28 April 2016
Available online 12 May 2016

A B S T R A C T

The Gulf of Mexico ecosystem is a hotspot for biological diversity and supports a number of industries, from tourism to fishery production to oil and gas exploration, that serve as the economic backbone of Gulf coast states. The Gulf is a natural hydrocarbon basin, rich with stores of oil and gas that lie in reservoirs deep beneath the seafloor. The natural seepage of hydrocarbons across the Gulf system is extensive and, thus, the system’s biological components experience ephemeral, if not, frequent, hydrocarbon exposure. In contrast to natural seepage, which is diffuse and variable over space and time, the 2010 Macondo oil well blowout, represented an intense, focused hydrocarbon infusion to the Gulf’s deepwaters. The Macondo blowout drove rapid shifts in microbial populations and activity, revealed unexpected phenomena, such as deepwater hydrocarbon plumes and marine “oil snow” sedimentation, and impacted the Gulf's pelagic and benthic ecosystems. Understanding the distribution and fate of Macondo oil was limited to some degree by an insufficient ability to predict the physical movement of water in the Gulf. In other words, the available physical oceanographic models lacked critical components. In the past six years, much has been learned about the physical oceanography of the Gulf, providing transformative knowledge that will improve the ability to predict the movement of water and the hydrocarbons they carry in future blowout scenarios. Similarly, much has been learned about the processing and fate of Macondo hydrocarbons. Here, we provide an overview of the distribution, fate and impacts of Macondo hydrocarbons and offer suggestions for future research to push the field of oil spill response research forward.

© 2016 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

Contents

1. Introduction .......................................................... 5
   1.1. The Gulf of Mexico ecosystem .................................. 5
   1.2. The deepwater horizon oil well blowout ...................... 6
2. Hydrocarbon input, distribution, and fate ......................... 6
   2.1. Natural seepage compared to the DWH hydrocarbon discharge . 6
   2.2. Marine "oil snow" .............................................. 8
   2.3. Incorporation of hydrocarbons into the food web ............ 10
   2.4. Seafloor sedimented oil ...................................... 11
3. Physical oceanography ............................................. 11
4. Hydrocarbon and dispersant impacts on biological communities. 13

* Corresponding author. Tel.: +1 706 542 5893; fax: +1 706 542 6888.
E-mail address: mjoye@uga.edu (S.B. Joye).

http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.dsr2.2016.04.018
0967-0645/© 2016 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.
1. Introduction

1.1. The Gulf of Mexico ecosystem

The Gulf of Mexico (Gulf) is prolific hydrocarbon basin. Approximately 22,000 natural seeps have been identified from seismic data (http://1.usa.gov/1aKybyq), and 1000 of these generate perennial oil slicks that are visible from space. Active seep zones in the Gulf, characterized as seepage cells, are found across the entire ecosystem (Fig. 1; MacDonald et al. 2015b), though seeps are more abundant in the northwest and central sectors. Hydrocarbon fluxes and distributions in the Gulf are strongly modulated by geophysical forcing, including salt tectonics and complex ocean circulation. The Gulf’s naturally occurring benthic and pelagic communities experience fluctuating physical regimes and geochemistry, which together act to induce dramatic variations in hydrocarbon exposure. Natural seepage provides an analog to accidental hydrocarbon releases, albeit at a much lower discharge rate. The responses of biological communities to changing hydrocarbon exposure and the role these factors play in defining the ability of these communities to endure hydrocarbon exposure remain poorly understood, even at high flux cold seeps.

The seepage of oil and gas at cold seeps inherently connects the Gulf’s surface waters to the seafloor (Fig. 2). Cold seeps in the Gulf are sources of focused and intense inputs of light hydrocarbon gases and oil to seabed sediments and benthic communities, and, through mixing, to the overlying water column. For example, multiple lines of evidence show that there is an increase in phytoplankton biomass in surface waters affected by natural seeps (D’Souza et al., 2016).

In seep sediments, microbial communities oxidize a fraction of the oil and gas fluxing through the system, but hydrocarbon are still released into the water column where they may be further oxidized and/or assimilated by water column microbial populations (Joye et al., 2004; Fig. 2). The energy-rich substrates present in seeping fluids, e.g. oil, gas and dissolved organic carbon, and by-products of seafloor hydrocarbon oxidation, e.g. hydrogen sulfide, fuel the establishment and growth of endemic seep chemosynthetic megafauna and opportunistic fauna that use seeps as foraging grounds (Cordes et al., 2009). Once transformed through biological or chemical processes, seep hydrocarbons can be viewed as “petrocarbon”, which can be traced quantitatively through both biotic and abiotic compartments of the Gulf system (Chanton et al., 2015).

Seeps also host enormous shallow gas hydrate deposits, whose presence influences oil and gas fluxes to the water column (Fig. 2; Joye et al., 2004; Latham et al., 2013, 2014; Wilson et al., 2014). At the seafloor, seeps increase habitat heterogeneity and support a variety of biological communities, ranging from well-adapted but poorly identified microorganisms, to thriving megafaunal assemblages based around biomass-dominant symbiotic tubeworms and mussels (Fisher et al., 2007; Cordes et al., 2010). Megafaunal biomass depends upon the metabolic byproducts of microbiocally processed deeply-sourced hydrocarbons (Cordes et al., 2009). One consequence of seep microbial metabolism is authigenic carbonate formation, which traps mineralized carbon along the seabed. These carbonates can support colonial deep-water corals and a

Fig. 1. Natural seep zones in the Gulf of Mexico. Each point is the geographic average of oil slick origins discharged from a discrete geologic seep approximately 2 km in diameter. Estimated total active seep zones total 914 locations (MacDonald et al. 2015b).
The origin of this layer was likely due to rapidly sinking marine sediments on deep-sea animals, including corals in the mesophotic zone below the surface oil (Montagne et al., 2013). Though microbial processes play a key role in modulating hydrocarbon fluxes through oxidation of gas and oil in the sediments and water column, the environmental factors regulating this critical consumptive activity are poorly constrained in all system components (a, b, and c).

1.2. The deepwater horizon oil well blowout

The Gulf ecosystem was subject to an extreme perturbation beginning on April 22nd, 2010, when the Deepwater Horizon (DWH) drilling platform sank following an explosion and fire on April 20th. When the platform sank, the riser pipe was severed leading to an uncontrolled release of oil and gas into the Gulf’s deep waters. By the time the well was capped in mid July, more than 5 million barrels of oil and some 250,000 metric tonnes of hydrocarbon gases had been discharged into the Gulf (Joye, 2015). Over 2 million gallons of chemical dispersants were applied as a response measure (Lubchenco et al., 2012).

The DWH blowout generated a suite of unexpected phenomena. First of all, about 50% of the discharged oil and all of the discharged low molecular weight gases, namely methane (Joye, 2015) was entrained in the so-called DWH “deepwater plume” (Diercks et al., 2010; Joye et al., 2011; Reddy et al., 2012). The DWH blowout also revealed the importance of sedimentation as a fate of discharged oil (Chanton et al., 2015; Valentine et al., 2014). In September 2010, researchers observed a unique sedimentary layer that carpeted the seafloor near and some distance from the wellhead (Hastings et al., 2016; Joye et al., 2014; Brooks et al., 2015). The origin of this layer was likely due to rapidly sinking marine “oil snow” particles with size of 0.5 mm or larger, formed by biological processes in response to the discharged DWH oil (Arnosti et al., 2016; Passow et al., 2012; Zierové et al., 2012). The Thorium-234 content of the layer indicates a rapid-sedimentation event associated with the DWH discharge (Brooks et al., 2015; Chanton et al., 2015). This phenomenon was unexpected, and thus was not included in the official “oil budget” (http://1.usa.gov/1hVeK9Q). The impact of deep hydrocarbon plumes and extreme sedimentation events on deep-sea animals, including corals (White et al., 2012; Fisher et al., 2014a,b) and sediment infauna (Montagne et al., 2013) was severe. Sinking or storm-driven mixing of oil to the outer continental shelf has been linked to injuries among corals in the mesopthic zone below the surface oil (Silva et al., 2016).

Here, we review the state of Gulf ecosystem science six years after the disaster. We begin with an examination of natural seepage in the Gulf, provide an updated oil budget for the DWH event, and explore the fate of the discharged DWH hydrocarbons. Next, we discuss the physical oceanography of the Gulf system, underscoring how the dynamic nature of the system makes predicting the fate of oil quite complicated and challenging. Then, we explore the fate of hydrocarbons in the system. Throughout, we address lingering questions and unknowns to guide and foster future research efforts.

2. Hydrocarbon input, distribution, and fate

2.1. Natural seepage compared to the DWH hydrocarbon discharge

Hydrocarbon seepage from the seafloor varies dramatically over and time, complicating quantification of rates of natural seepages. Satellite remote sensing data offer an effective way to compile a comprehensive inventory of persistent background oil sources in the present-day Gulf of Mexico and to trace the paths by which fossil carbon re-enters the present-day carbon cycle. MacDonald et al. (2015b) analyzed 176 SAR images collected over the Gulf prior to 2010 with use of the Texture Classifying Neural Network Algorithm (TCNNA). This semi-supervised routine was developed for detecting floating oil slicks in SAR images (Garcia-Pineda et al., 2009). Oil slicks are typically linear targets ~100 m wide and 10 km or more in length; each has an origin (OSO or oil slick origin) at the point where the streams of oil bubbles released from a natural seep reach the ocean surface (De Beukelaer et al., 2003). OSO features that clustered in restricted localities and were detected in multiple images indicated the occurrence of seabed seep zones, controlled by underlying geologic features that allow hydrocarbons to escape into the water column from subsurface reservoirs through faults (Abrams, 2005; Garcia-Pineda et al., 2010; Whelan et al., 2005).

The SAR analysis identified 914 active seep zones (MacDonald et al., 2015a; Fig. 1). Seep zones tended to be concentrated in a north to south zone from the Texas-Louisiana Slope, through the Sigsbee Knolls and the Campeche Knolls (Bryant et al., 1991), with a cluster of sources that occur within the super-giant Cantarell
Complex oil field on the Campeche Bank of the Yucatan Peninsula (Miranda et al., 2004). The association of these seep zones with the well-documented salt-tectonic stratigraphy of the Gulf of Mexico (McBride et al., 1998; Watkins et al., 1978) is underscored by the progressive curtailment of natural discharges eastward along the Mississippi-Alabama Slope toward the Florida Platform, where salt bodies are absent (Hine et al., 2003; Pindell and Kennan, 2007). A bootstrap analysis of the average size of the surface slicks was used to estimate the annual flux of oil from natural sources to the surface ocean for the entire Gulf of Mexico and for the northwest, northeast, southeast and southwest regions of the basin (Table 1). The results indicate an annual input of 1.6–6.0 \times 10^8 barrels of oil per year across the entire Gulf. This agrees reasonably well with provisional estimates from earlier, less comprehensive studies (National Research Council, Committee on Oil in the Sea, 2003). In contrast, oil produced by the offshore energy industry in U.S. waters amounts to about 1.5 \times 10^6 barrels per day. Natural seepage is not evenly distributed across the Gulf; 68% of natural seep oil has been observed in the northwest region, and 7% in the northeast region in the vicinity of the Deepwater Horizon oil spill.

At the onset of the Deepwater Horizon oil well blowout, it was unclear whether, and if so, at what rate, hydrocarbons were being discharged from the damaged riser pipe. Early estimates of discharge rates of 1000 to 5000 barrels of oil per day (BOPD) were far too low. Satellite remote sensing observations, such as those described above, were among the first to cast doubt on the low initial discharge estimates. Data obtained during (satellite data) and after (submersible and remotely operated vehicle observations) the DWH event demonstrate the difficulty in forensic determination of oil sources and fates in a complex field.

Numerous natural seeps exist within ~25 km of the MC252 lease block where the Macondo well blew out (Garcia-Pineda et al., 2016). However, consistent with the Gulf-wide results of MacDonald et al. (2015a,b), the surface oil slicks produced by these sources were small and intermittently visible relative to the volume of hydrocarbons discharged from the wellhead. Submersible observations documented relatively restricted development of the chemosynthetic communities and carbonate hard grounds in this area compared to the widespread nature of these formations in the western and central Gulf (Roberts et al., 2010).

Shortly after the Macondo wellhead was capped (on 4 August 2010), NOAA released an oil budget for the incident (http://1.usa.gov/1T09EL1); the original oil budget was revised a few months later, on 23 November 2010 (http://1.usa.gov/1T09EL1). Today, the distribution and fate of Macondo hydrocarbons remains a topic of debate. Using the data from three synthesis papers (Camilli et al., 2012, McNutt et al., 2012; Rynerson et al., 2012), we present updated values for hydrocarbon discharge, distribution and fate (Table 2, Fig. 3). Because discharge was not determined directly and repeatedly throughout the incident, the error associated with discharge estimates summed across the time of discharge is significant (Joye, 2015). Available data from Camilli et al. (2012) and McNutt et al. (2012) suggest that between 724,975 and 1,014,964 metric tonnes of hydrocarbons were discharged from the wellhead. Low molecular weight alkane gases, predominantly methane, accounted for roughly 30% of the total hydrocarbon discharge (160,284 to 224,361 metric tonnes gaseous alkanes) (Table 2, Fig. 3a).

The distribution of the discharged hydrocarbons was similarly difficult to constrain because of the physically dynamic nature of the impacted area and a lack of systematic measurements of oil and gas distribution from the ocean surface to the bottom throughout the incident (Joye, 2015). We revisit DWH hydrocarbon distributions using the discharge data from Camilli et al. (2012) and McNutt et al. (2012), and additional data constraining evaporation rates from Rynerson et al. (2012) (Fig. 3b). The most significant difference between the distributions presented in Fig. 3b and the original NOAA oil budgets is the reduction in loss due to evaporation from 23% evaporated/dissolved to 5% evaporated and 18% dissolved (Rynerson et al., 2012). The total discharge estimate spans a range of approximately 30%. McNutt et al. (2012) present high and low end scenarios with no estimate of error while the flux measurement of Camilli et al. (2012) includes an error of

### Table 1

Summary statistics for inventory of oil-covered water detected in 176 independent SAR image samples of the Gulf of Mexico. The Gulf is gridded in 10 x 10 km² cells, which were divided into four subregions along the lines of 25° north latitude and 90° west longitude. Each cell was sampled in multiple SAR images. Standard deviations were calculated from 100,000 bootstrap replications. Annual discharge volume estimates assume that natural oil slicks of area shown and 0.1 μm thickness persist for 8–24 h, with one standard deviation added to or subtracted from the upper and lower bounds, respectively. Reproduced from MacDonald et al. (2015a,b).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subregion</th>
<th>Mean oil cover</th>
<th>Area (10^6 km²)</th>
<th>Fraction of total</th>
<th>SD (m²)</th>
<th>Lower bound (barrels)</th>
<th>Upper bound (barrels)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Northwest</td>
<td>530</td>
<td>321,000</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>68.45</td>
<td>1.60 \times 10^6</td>
<td>4.12 \times 10^6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northeast</td>
<td>52.4</td>
<td>421,000</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>28.11</td>
<td>8.87 \times 10^4</td>
<td>5.54 \times 10^4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southwest</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>501,000</td>
<td>3.35</td>
<td>10.96</td>
<td>3.53 \times 10^3</td>
<td>2.54 \times 10^4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southeast</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>220,000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1.57 \times 10^3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Gulf</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>1,473,000</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>86.24</td>
<td>2.51 \times 10^4</td>
<td>9.43 \times 10^4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 2

Updated oil budget for the Deepwater Horizon Macondo well blowout.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>BOPD</th>
<th>std dev</th>
<th>HC discharge</th>
<th>Tonnes oil</th>
<th>Tonnes gas</th>
<th>HC discharge</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(g/yr)</td>
<td>(g/yr)</td>
<td>(gigagrams)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(metric tonnes)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Camilli et al. (2012)</td>
<td>57,000</td>
<td>9,800</td>
<td>826.5</td>
<td>643,800</td>
<td>182,700</td>
<td>826,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McNutt et al. (2012) (low)</td>
<td>50,000</td>
<td>n.r.</td>
<td>725</td>
<td>564,717</td>
<td>160,258</td>
<td>724,975</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McNutt et al. (2012) (high)</td>
<td>70,000</td>
<td>n.r.</td>
<td>1015</td>
<td>1,014,964</td>
<td>224,361</td>
<td>1,014,964</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

n.r. = not reported

a BOPD = barrels of oil per day.

b HC discharge = total hydrocarbon (HC) discharge.
about 17%. It is worth noting that this 17% error reflects the error of the flow rate measurement, not the variability over time of discharge from the well.

The vertical distribution of oil and gas differed significantly, generating unexpected consequences: 100% of discharged gases were entrained in the subsurface/deepwater hydrocarbon plume and 50% of the discharged oil was entrained in the plume while the rest rose to the surface, forming extensive surface oil slicks (Joye, 2015). This documented vertical segregation in hydrocarbon distribution made it impossible to estimate the discharge rate accurately from SAR imagery as half of the oil was invisible, suspended in the deepwater plumes. As such, it is imperative to quantify discharge rates at the wellhead directly and frequently during a deepwater blowout incident.

An even more difficult task is faced when attempting to assign a fate to the discharged oil and gas. Early reports generated conflicting estimates of oil biodegradation rates, with one study reporting rapid biodegradation on the time scale of weeks (for alkanes; Hazen et al., 2010), and another reporting sluggish biodegradation activity (based on oxygen drawdown and hydrocarbon concentrations; Camilli et al., 2010) in the deepwater oil plume. Similarly, an early report of slow methane oxidation rates (Valentine et al., 2010) was followed by a paper showing a rapid acceleration in methane oxidation activity in the deepwater plume followed by a precipitous drop and very low rates of activity in concert with a 10-fold decrease in plume methane concentrations (Crespo-Medina et al., 2014).

Clearly, there are insufficient rate measurements available to constrain the fate of discharged oil and gas in a robust manner. However, estimates of hydrocarbon biodegradation were estimated from deepwater oxygen anomalies (Kessler et al., 2011; Du and Kessler, 2012). Du and Kessler (2012) used oxygen anomaly data to estimate the mass of oxidized hydrocarbons at 280,000 metric tonnes. Comparing that estimate of microbial consumption to amount of hydrocarbons discharged provides a rough estimate of the amount of biodegradation. This calculation reveals that between 28% and 34% of the discharged hydrocarbons were consumed in deepwaters (Fig. 3c & d). An additional 2–15% of the discharged oil was returned to the seafloor via sedimentation (Chanton et al., 2015; Valentine et al., 2014). Considering the sum of hydrocarbons consumed through biological oxidation, the amount returned to the seafloor via sedimentation, and the amount recovered (25%), leaves up to ~40% of the discharged hydrocarbon unaccounted for (Fig. 3c and d). Some fraction of these unaccounted for hydrocarbons could have been oxidized in more shallow or surface waters, some may have sedimented to the benthos, and some could have been delivered to shorelines (Joye, 2015). Below, we discuss in detail the fates and impacts of Macondo hydrocarbons.

2.2. Marine “oil” snow

Marine snow, operationally defined as composite particles > 0.5 mm, represent oases in the water column, providing surfaces and substrate in an environment largely devoid of both (Allredge and Silver, 1988). Marine snow aggregates are thus hot spots where microbial communities develop and exhibit accelerated rates of activity (Azam and Long, 2001). Due to their large size relative to most particles in the ocean, marine snow is also pivotal for the transport of organic matter from the surface ocean to depth (Asper et al., 1992). Only large particles sink at velocities fast enough to reach the deep ocean before degrading or dissolving. Globally, sedimentation of marine snow is the most important transport process delivering food to many deep sea organisms and driving carbon sequestration by the ocean. Combining many small particles into fewer larger marine snow particles additionally impacts food web interactions, allowing large organisms to feed on particles that would otherwise be too small to ingest individually.
Commonly marine snow is formed by one of two mechanisms: zooplankton activity or physical coagulation of particles (Aldredge and Silver, 1988). Zooplankton feeding activity produces feeding structures, like pteropod webs or appendicularian houses that, when discarded form marine snow. When food is abundant, fecal pellets may include many intact and undigested food particles; these fecal pellets are also considered marine snow. Coagulation of particles requires that individual particles are large and/or abundant enough to allow coagulation due to physical forces like turbulence or due to differential settling of particles (Jackson, 1990). Upon collision particles must remain attached; the probability of which is determined by their stickiness. Diatom aggregates are a common form of marine snow found after dense blooms, but other phytoplankton, small fecal pellets or detrital particles may all form marine snow via coagulation. The formation of large mucus-rich flocs, which can lead to extreme foam events as have been observed in the North Sea and the Mediterranean after Phaeocystis sp. blooms (Lancelot et al., 1994; Blauw et al., 2010) or in the Adriatic, often in association with specific biological and physical conditions (Monti et al., 1995; Stachowitsch et al., 1990) is not well understood.

Extracellular polymeric substances (EPS), the basis for mucous in the ocean, may be released by most eukaryotic and prokaryotic plankton (Decho and Herndl, 1995; Hoagland et al., 1993; Passow, 2002a). There are many different types of EPS, each with varying functions: Transparent exopolymer particles (TEP), which are rich in acidic polysaccharides, are a class of EPS that is crucial for the formation of all types of marine snow (Aldredge et al., 1993; Passow, 2002b). TEP are an order of magnitude stickier than other marine particles, thereby enhancing coagulation. Feeding structures of zooplankton also are rich in acidic polysaccharides, which form the mucus matrix that holds component particles of marine snow together. For some eukaryotic autotrophs, e.g. diatoms, the release of TEP appears to be an important mechanism to balance light harvesting and carbon acquisition capabilities in a constantly changing environment (Passow and Laws, 2015). But enhanced production of EPS is also a common response of most marine microbes to specific substances like trace metals, antibiotics or oil. TEP may act as a protectant for cells, or as an emulsifier or surfactant to hydrophobic substances like oil, making them more bioavailable to cells.

Although the importance of marine snow for the cycling and distribution of carbon, nutrients and trace elements has been known for years, the role of marine snow in dictating the distribution of oil was not appreciated until the DWH oil spill. Oil spill research triggered by the DWH accident brought to light the importance of marine oil snow sedimentation and floc accumulation (MOSSFA) events in the context of oil spills (Daly et al., 2016). Sedimentation of oil, largely via marine snow, and the accumulation of large amounts of marine particles and oil on the seafloor was one of the principal distribution pathways of the spilled DWH oil (Joye, 2015; Passow and Hetland, submitted for publication), and this material impacted benthic ecosystems (Montagna et al., 2013; White et al., 2012) as well as species relying on these ecosystems (Murawski et al., 2014). Although not observed or expected, the formation and sedimentation of marine oil snow was probably important in previous spills as well (Vonk et al., 2015).

Large mucus-rich flocs formed in the vicinity of oil slicks during the DWH spill (Passow et al., 2012; Ziervogel et al., 2012). These marine snow particles apparently formed due to excessive mucus production of the microbial community in response to the oil (Gutierrez et al., 2013). The formation of this microbial oil snow in the absence of particles > 1 μm was simulated in laboratory experiments, proving that these cm-sized marine snow particles did not form due to coagulation or zooplankton activity (Passow, 2016). Instead, the microbial response to certain weathered oil components appeared to be required for their formation (Gutierrez et al., 2013; Passow, 2016; Ziervogel et al., 2012; Kleindienst et al., 2015b). These mucus floccs consisted predominantly of fossil carbon, revealing that microbes used oil as their carbon source for the production of these structures that functionally mimic biofilms.

Independently, additional marine oil snow or oil associated marine snow formed due to coagulation of phytoplankton (e.g. Fig. 4). In the wake of the spill, exceptional diatom blooms were observed in the Northern Gulf (Hu et al., 2011), and the sedimentation of a large Skeletonema sp. bloom was observed to transport large amounts of oil to the seafloor (Yan et al., in preparation). Laboratory experiments confirmed that oil is incorporated into diatom aggregates during their formation, and/or scavenged by diatom snow sinking through layers contaminated with
ocean layer visible to satellite sensors; storm events produced an
importance of wind mixing for removing
Remote sensing data also show the possible effect of Corexit
in the Gulf (south and west of the DWH site, the transport mechanism for oil
the deep-water plumes may have impacted the benthos to the
waters and potential impacts to the planktonic community
(snow and leading to another pulse of increased microbial activity
avenue for future research.
processes for MOSSFA is ongoing and represents an important
relative importance of the different marine oil snow formation
and gelation of colloidal
scopically visible mucus
hand, preliminary results suggest that Corexit disperses TEP. Our
presence of Corexit likely triggers the production of EPS by many
marine snow formation is contentious. On the one hand, the
2013
oil snow also formed due to zooplankton activity (Almeda et al.,
2013; Lee et al., 2012; Mitra et al., 2012). Determination of the relative importance of the different marine oil snow formation processes for MOSSFA is ongoing and represents an important avenue for future research.
The effect of chemical dispersants such as Corexit9500 on marine snow formation is contentious. On the one hand, the presence of Corexit likely triggers the production of EPS by many organisms, especially by heterotrophic bacteria. On the other hand, preliminary results suggest that Corexit disperses TEP. Our current understanding suggests that TEP (including macroscopically visible mucus flocs) are largely formed via annealing and gelation of colloidal fibrils (Bar-Zeev et al., 2015; Verdugo and Santachi, 2010). The dispersion of micro-gels and TEP into such fibrils would lead to reduced coagulation, until the Corexit is degraded, which allows for reformation of TEP. At that point, the aggregation rate increased, leading to a delay in aggregation compared to scenarios without Corexit. These two opposing processes, namely enhanced formation of precursors and inhibition of TEP and micro-gel formation, can explain the seemingly conflicting results on the effects of Corexit on aggregation (Fu et al., 2014; Passow, 2016).
As observed in biofilms, unique microbial communities, substantially different from those in the surrounding seawater, develop on marine oil snow. Marine oil snow microbial communities were functionally different from those in the surrounding seawater or those on marine snow that was not associated with oil (Arnosti et al., 2016). When aged, this marine snow sank at velocities similar to other types of snow (Passow et al., 2012). Settling of oil containing marine snow impacted microbial communities of deep sea sediments (Ziervogel et al., 2016-b) and altered redox conditions on the seafloor (Hastings et al., 2016). Once settled, this material was resuspended during storm events, re-forming marine snow and leading to another pulse of increased microbial activity (Ziervogel et al., 2016-a).
During the DWH incident, marine snow formation in surface waters and potential impacts to the planktonic community depended on the presence of floating oil. Although oil entrained in the deep-water plumes may have impacted the benthos to the south and west of the DWH site, the transport mechanism for oil that impacted the pelagic and benthic environment of the continental shelf and slope to the north and east of the DWH site was via the surface ocean. Remote sensing data played a crucial role in tracking this component of the spill (Leifer et al., 2012). Synthetic aperture radar data were used to compile a regular time-series of surface oil distributions and magnitudes throughout the 24 April to 3 August 2010 interval when surface oil from DWH was present in the Gulf (MacDonald et al., 2015a,b). These results point to the importance of wind mixing for removing floating oil from the ocean layer visible to satellite sensors; storm events produced an immediate reduction in surface oil, some of which may have then sunk to the benthos as marine snow (MacDonald et al., 2015a,b).
Remote sensing data also show the possible effect of Corexit application in the subsurface plume, which began in force after amputation of the riser on 2 June 2010 focused the discharge at a single point (McNutt et al., 2012) and increased to over 35,000 l/day during the remainder of June (Lehr et al., 2010). Comparison of two equivalent intervals before and after subsea dispersant applications show that the surface oil volume decreased by 21%, while the ocean area over which the remaining oil was distributed increased by 49% (MacDonald et al., 2015a,b). Increasing the surface footprint of oil altered the region potentially impacted by marine oil snow formation/dynamics.

2.3. Incorporation of hydrocarbons into the food web

The DWH event released large quantities of methane into the water column in addition to oil (see above). Methane is a particularly good foodstock for microorganisms, and high percentages of methane are incorporated into biomass during microbial methane oxidation (Gommers et al., 1988; Borjesson et al., 2001). The extreme abundance of methanotrophic mussels found at cold seeps stands is a testament to this assertion (Childress et al., 1986; Paull et al., 1992). A biomass conversion ratio of 0.4 ± 0.1 was estimated for methane by Du and Kessler (2012) during the DWH event. Stable carbon isotopes (δ13C) and radiocarbon (Δ14C) have been applied to track methane and petroleum compounds in biomass. At the 1000–1200 m depth in the DWH deepwater hydrocarbon plume, Fernández et al. (in revision) found low δ13C (−30 to −25%) and Δ14C (−603 to −55%) values for suspended particles at some 289 km SW of the wellhead, providing direct evidence for incorporation of methane and petroleum into the suspended particles of the Gulf. Crespo Medina et al. (2014) documented rapid rates of microbial methane oxidation and additional genetic evidence for the increased abundance of methanotrophic bacteria at plume depths. These studies clearly demonstrated the transformation of methane into methanotroph biomass and particulate organic carbon.
Sampling in 2011 and 2012 yielded similar results (Cherrier et al., 2014) as Gulf suspended particulate organic material was as depleted as −37‰ and −618‰ in δ13C and Δ14C, respectively. In the studies discussed above, the 13C and 14C values were highly correlated and decreased contemporaneously, suggesting that radiocarbon dead methane with an isotopic value around ~60‰ as an end-member, similar to the values reported for DWH methane, ranging from −61.1%±2.2 (n=18, Valentine et al., 2010) to −57.4%±0.4% (n=27, Crespo Medina et al., 2014), was incorporated into the foodweb.
The POC results described above were consistent with the hypothesis proposed by Chanton et al. (2012) that methane derived carbon entered the food web through small particles, typical of the sarcina-type clusters formed by highly active methanotrophic bacteria. Possibly, microbial cells were converted into particulate organic matter by the viral shunt (Wilhelm and Suttle, 1999, Crespo-Medina et al., 2014). Stable isotopic evidence alone (Graham et al., 2010) suggested that oil-derived carbon, or petrocarbon, had entered the planktonic food web. Radiocarbon, which is a more sensitive tracer than δ13C, later corroborated the stable isotope evidence (Chanton et al., 2012). On average, plankton values were depleted in 14C relative to surface DIC (dissolved inorganic carbon) which was about +40‰, and a significant linear correlation was observed between 14C and 13C in plankton which suggested that methane was a significant portion of the petrocarbon incorporated into the planktonic foodweb.
There was also evidence consistent with the hypothesis that petrocarbon was incorporated to fish and invertebrate tissue. Wilson et al. (2016) observed a west to east gradient in tissue 14C content. More depleted 14C values were found in Terrebonne Bay, Louisiana, with values as low as −10‰ in invertebrate soft tissue
suggested assimilation of roughly 2–3% fossil carbon. To the east, $^{14}$C values were more positive, indicating less fossil-C input. For example, the tissues of both oysters and catfish collected in coastal Louisiana were significantly depleted in both $^{14}$C and $^{13}$C relative to similar fauna collected in the oil-unaffected Apalachicola Bay, Florida ($p < 0.014$).

Wilson et al. (2016) also compared $^{14}$C values of organic tissues and shells of coastal mollusks. The shells record the isotopic composition of dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC) in the water column. Invertebrate tissue $^{14}$C values were generally depleted relative to their shells, consistent with the hypothesis that the depleted tissue values were the result of an input of $^{14}$C-depleted POC, rather than a $^{14}$C-poor DIC pool as might be expected if the riverine source water was controlling the observed $^{14}$C-depletion. Alternative explanations for these results include the possibility of chronic hydrocarbon pollution along the Louisiana Gulf coast or the ingestion by these organisms of carbon derived from $^{14}$C-depleted organic matter mobilized during the erosion of coastal marshes in southern Louisiana.

2.4. Seafloor sedimented oil

Petrocarbon could have been transported to the seafloor by a number of mechanisms. As described above, weathered oil coagulated with marine snow or without clay particles and was removed from the surface of the Gulf to the deep through the so-called MOSSFA process (Daly et al., 2016). In addition, particles may have rained down through the deep sea plume at 1000–1200 m, picked up petrocarbon, and been carried to the seafloor as oil-mineral aggregates (Valentine et al., 2014; Reddy et al., 2012). Microbial density was high in the deep-sea plume (Crespo-Medina et al., 2014), and the same bacteria that dominated the water column were found in surface sediments (Mason et al., 2012, 2014). It is also likely that microbial activity within the deep-sea plume formed sinking oil-containing aggregates (Kleindienst et al., 2015a,b,c). Surface burning consumed 5–6% of the surface oil (Lehr et al., 2010) and this process may have allowed black carbon and oil to fall the seafloor. Black carbon formed by this process could have promoted rapid sediment deposition as it is very surface active (Koelmans et al., 2006) and has been shown to stimulate particle aggregation and absorption of dissolved organic carbon and to increase bacterial abundance (Mari et al., 2014). Another mechanism moving oil from the surface to the deep is transfer of petrocarbon to the sediment following ingestion by zooplankton and subsequent fecal pellet formation and release (Muschenheim and Lee, 2002).

Rapid sedimentation in the form of a brief depositional pulse was observed in the De Soto canyon by Brooks et al. (2015) and within a large zone around the wellhead (Chanton et al., 2015; Joye et al., 2014; Valentine et al., 2014). In De Soto canyon, excess $^{234}$Th inventories and profiles indicated the deposition of a 1 cm thick layer over a 4–5 month period coincident with and following the oil spill. The $^{234}$Th inventories were elevated in surface sediments by factors of from 4–10 fold relative to the years following the spill. Benthic foraminifera declined in all 2010 cores and recovered in later years at some sites, but not others. The interpretation of a rapid sedimentation pulse was confirmed by observations of stratification in solid phase Mn, which is controlled by redox state, diagenesis and deposition (Hastings et al., 2016).

Using the inverse tracer $^{14}$C (Reddy et al., 2002; White et al., 2005, 2008), and hopane tracers, Chanton et al. (2015) and Valentine et al. (2014) indicated that the deposition of petrocarbon following the spill was widespread but confined to the upper 1 cm of the seafloor for the most part. Chanton et al. suggested that the fossil carbon contaminated layer included 1.6 to 2.6 x $10^{10}$ g of oil derived carbon which represented 0.5 to 9.1% of the released petrocarbon with a best estimate of 3–5% over an area of 8400 km$^2$. Valentine et al. (2014) estimated that amount to be around 2–14% of the total released oil over an area of 3200 km$^2$. Because sedimentation rates were not determined during the DWH incident, estimates of sedimentation as a fate for oil are likely low.

3. Physical oceanography

From a physical oceanographic perspective, the aftermath of the Deepwater Horizon spill was accompanied by the realization that our knowledge of transport and mixing in this semi-enclosed basin was very much incomplete. During the spill, tracking and forecasting of the oil trajectory was attempted using six modeling systems and virtual particles (Liu et al., 2011). The horizontal model resolution used in 2010 was 5 km or coarser. None of the available models was able to capture the complexity of the surface circulation in the region between the wellhead and the Mississippi River mouth, as portrayed by SAR images of the surface oil, or to simulate the oil degrading processes, the evolution of the deep oil plumes along and across isopycnal layers, and the three-dimensional circulation. With sufficient details to explain the observed distribution and accumulation rates of marine snow. While numerous efforts have been undertaken to improve our ability to understand and predict the Gulf’s circulation, no single modeling platform can yet simultaneously capture all the physic processes or spatial scales contributing to hydrocarbon transport in the environment.

Over the past 6 years, the appreciation for the complexity of the ecosystem has advanced our understanding of the mechanisms responsible for transport and mixing in the Gulf, especially at the ocean surface, at each of the scales involved, from centimeters to hundreds of kilometers. Before summarizing current knowledge on the processes that are mostly relevant, it is worth noting some of the unique characteristics of the northern Gulf of Mexico. This enclosed basin has a wide, shallow continental shelf, with water depths less than 200 m, that extends about 100 km or more along the northern coastline, except between the Mississippi Canyon and the Mississippi River delta, where the continental slope is rather steep to the east of the Mississippi Fan, and broader and more complex to the west. The near-surface dynamics are strongly influenced by the input of freshwater by the Mississippi–Atchafalaya River system which is usually more intense in late spring and summer than in winter and fall; and, finally, atmospheric circulation is characterized by two distinct seasons with South-easterlies, highly variable winds blowing between April and August and generally stronger Northeastelettes being predominant from September to March.

At centimeter scales, the combination of laboratory experiments and process modeling studies using large eddy simulations (LES) have contributed a better understanding of hydrocarbon dynamics at the air–sea interface, where multiphase air–sea–water processes, such as interfacial tension and viscosity, play a key role in the oil weathering (Soloviev et al., in press). Major advances have been made in elucidating the role of wind forcing and/or dispersants on oil fragmentation and emulsification, thus increasing our capability to predict how the air–sea–oil interface evolves under different forcing scenarios.

At meter scales turbulent processes relevant to the transport and weathering of oil include those contributing to the upper ocean turbulent boundary layer structure, including air–sea flux exchanges, surface waves, internal shear, waves and subsurface shear interactions, wave-breaking, and Langmuir circulations (Belcher et al., 2012; Dietrich et al., 2013; D’Asaro et al., 2014;
D’Asaro, 2014). Those processes are fundamental in shallow water, over the shelf and in inlets, where provide a route for oil sedimentation and re-suspension. Again LES techniques can be used to simulate the boundary layer structure, and modeling estimates of the vertical and horizontal mixing can be compared to those derived from observations. Most progress at those scales, at which observations are very scarce, will become apparent over the next few years (by 2021), in the wake of the Surf-zone Coastal Oil Pathways Experiment (SCOPE) and of the planned Submesoscale Processes and Lagrangian Analysis on the Shelf (SPLASH) campaign led by the CARTHE research consortium (see www.carthe.org for more information on the program).

The SCOPE experiment investigated dynamics across the coastline of the De Soto Canyon with surface drifters, dye released in the ocean boundary layer and observed from aerial platforms, high-resolution air–sea observations, upper ocean turbulence measurements. At the same time two classes of models were run in real-time for forecasting and evaluation purposes (Curcic and Chen, submitted for publication; Jut et al., submitted for publication; Jacobs et al., 2016; Huntley et al., 2015).

Progress has been made on understanding the role of instability processes at scales comprised between few hundreds of meters and 10 km and from hours to days, the so called submesoscales. Submesoscale circulation critically impacts transport and mixing in the upper ocean, and modifies mixed layer stratification. Submesoscale variability and the associated upper-ocean velocities dominate the vertical exchange processes (Thomas et al., 2008; Capet et al., 2008; Klein et al., 2008) and, through the formation of strongly localized converge zones, the lateral mixing of tracers (Capet et al., 2008; Haza et al., 2012; Lévy et al., 2011; Zhong and Bracco, 2013).

Theoretical developments and process modeling to resolve these scales has advanced our understanding of submesoscale dynamics (Boccaletti et al., 2007; Gula et al., 2014; McWilliams et al., 2009a; Molenaker et al., 2010). Submesoscale flows are energized by baroclinic instabilities that develop around mesoscale eddies and extract energy from the mixed layer (ML). Another mechanism that energizes submesoscale flows is surface frontogenesis (McWilliams et al., 2009b) that arises at the ocean vertical boundaries (near the surface and near the bottom) whenever the steepness of density surfaces is large (Capet et al., 2008; Lévy et al., 2012).

The prevalence of frontal structures in the northern Gulf of Mexico was evident during the DWH spill from the end of May onward, and fronts were dominant throughout the 2010 summer as well (e.g. Fig. 5 and also Fig. 3 in Walker et al., 2011). Their relevance in shaping transport and mixing in the Gulf of Mexico has been further confirmed by the Grand Lagrangian Deployment (GLAD) conducted in August 2012 (Poje et al., 2014; Jacobs et al., 2014; Berta et al., 2015; Mensa et al., 2015; Mariano et al., in press). The GLAD experiment consisted of the near simultaneous deployment of more than 300 GPS-tracked Lagrangian instruments and provided the largest upper ocean Lagrangian dispersion data-set to date fingerprinting ageostrophic, submesoscale motions as key in determining local dispersion rates. Post-spill investigations with process oriented and predictive models have then evaluated the uncertainties associated with the Loop Current’s near-term evolution through predictive models (Dukhovskoy et al., 2015) and the potential of the mesoscale predictability in the basin (Cardona and Bracco, 2014, 2016).

Several open questions remain involving transport mechanisms at the boundaries between different spatiotemporal scales where the dynamics and the energy transfer mechanisms transition between known regimes. For example no quantification is currently available of the interactions and feedback between waves, Langmuir circulation and submesoscale features, under different wind and/or freshwater conditions.

The DWH spill has also questioned our understanding of the processes responsible for transport and mixing at depth, along the continental slope of the northern Gulf. Observations of the deep-water plume that emerged from the ruptured wellhead in 2010 (Camilli et al., 2010; Diercks et al., 2010) provided a crude map of the directionality of the flow, but were not sufficient to establish lateral and diapycnal mixing coefficients. In 2012, a tracer was therefore injected at approximately 1100 m, comparable to the depth of the oil plume, and followed over twelve months (Ledwell et al., 2016). This experiment revealed that diapycnal mixing was greatly enhanced over the slope and that the rate of lateral homogenization was greater than observed in previous studies performed in the open ocean. Numerical simulations have reproduced those findings and suggest that submesoscale processes near the ocean bottom contribute to the observed mixing rates (Bracco et al., 2016). The presence of submesoscale eddies limits the predictability potential along the slope in the northern GoM: if the asymptotic behavior of pollutants or deep tracers is to be estimated through an ensemble of simulations, the trapping in and stirring by individual eddies and filaments must be considered. Submesoscale eddies and filaments may also explain the spotty distribution of the oil-impacted deep coral communities (Fishet al., 2014a,b).

Finally, model runs have pointed to the existence of two flow regimes in the deep Gulf. The De Soto Canyon is characterized by smaller mean flow velocity and reduced variability, and therefore limited dispersion, compared to the Mississippi and Central slope areas. Those differences result in limited transport between De Soto Canyon and the rest of the Gulf at depth, and greater advection and mixing for areas to the west of the Mississippi Fan, possibly explaining the distribution, connectivity and genetic differentiation of deep-sea mussels (Faure et al., 2015) and deep, cold-water corals (Cardona et al., in press). The interaction of submesoscale structures, tidal motions and near inertial waves, and the characterization of the vertical velocity field and its
variability throughout the water column remain subjects of on-going investigations.

4. Hydrocarbon and dispersant impacts on biological communities

4.1. Deepwater corals

There were impacts to deep-water corals at a variety of depths, likely stemming from hydrocarbon and dispersant transport along multiple pathways. The first coral impacts were observed approximately 11 km to the southwest of the well-head at 1370 m depth (White et al., 2012). This was in the direction of the sub-surface hydrocarbon and dispersant plume, and this site was within the depth range of the plume. When the coral colonies were first examined, they were coated in a dark brown flocculent material that covered, in some cases, over 90% of the colony (White et al., 2012). The corals exhibited signs of sloughing tissue, excessive mucous production, and enlarged sclerites (White et al., 2012). Samples of the flocculent material contained hydrocarbons with the fingerprint of the Macondo source oil (White et al., 2012) and contained dispersant residues indicative of oil: dispersant ratios of 0.01 – 0.8% (White et al., 2014). The flocculent material was colonized by microbial communities that were significantly different from surrounding sediments, with a prevalence of aerobic hydrocarbon degrading phylogenotypes in the coral floc (Simister et al., 2016). It is unclear whether this material was sourced from the deep-water plume produced at the well-head, or whether it was primarily material that had traveled to the surface and then returned to the seafloor as oiled marine snow (Passow et al., 2012). The patchy pattern of impact, particularly on the corals that exhibited less severe damage, suggests the importance of the surface-derived marine snow transport mechanism, but the sub-surface plume could have also contributed to the decline in coral health during the event (Hsing et al., 2013; Fisher et al., 2014a).

Over time, return visits to the original site, Mississippi Canyon 294, allowed for the description of the time course in coral health and pathology. Within a few months, the flocculent material was no longer apparent, and in some cases the exposed skeleton of the corals was colonized by hydroids (Hsing et al., 2013). This secondary colonization contributed to the continuing decline in health of the most severely impacted colonies, while some of the colonies with the lowest initial impact showed signs of tissue regrowth and improved health (Hsing et al., 2013; Fisher et al., 2014a). By following these colonies over time, similar impacts could be recognized in coral colonies at other sites that were discovered later.

Additional field surveys revealed more deep-sea sites that showed similar impact to the corals, ranging from 1300 to 1900 m depth and as far away as 22 km from the Deepwater Horizon well head (Deepwater Horizon Natural Resource Damage Assessment Trustees, 2016). These sites were primarily colonized by Paramuricea biscaya, but other species of corals were present including Paragorgia regalis, Sphinctogorgia nuda, and a keratoisinid bamboo coral species (Doughty et al., 2013; Quattrini et al., 2014), individual colonies of which showed signs of impact (Fisher et al., 2014a). In addition to the corals, impacts were apparent in the soft-sediment macrofaunal communities that were associated with the coral sites. Hydrocarbon concentrations were elevated in the top layers of the sediments in these cores, an indication that the exposure came from the water column rather than natural seepage from below (Fisher et al., 2014b). Community shifts were apparent in the higher nematode:copepod ratio as well as increases in opportunistic families of polychaetes (capitellids, cirratulids, and paraonoids) and declines in the numbers of amphipods and the families of polychaetes (dorvilleids) known to be sensitive to disturbance (Fisher et al., 2014b). The presence of damage from the spill at these sites expanded the overall benthic footprint of the spill to the southeast where few other studies were carried out.

At mesophotic depths, octocoral colonies were discovered in 2011 that showed patchy impacts and hydroid colonization reminiscent of the octocoral colonies at deeper depths (Silva et al., 2016). The transport of oil and dispersant to these depths was potentially facilitated by the wind-driven mixing of Tropical Storm Bonnie, which passed over these sites in July, 2010 (Silva et al., 2016). The frequency of impact at these shallower sites was approximately 10 times greater than was apparent at control sites or during previous random transect surveys that had been obtained at the same sites prior to the spill (Etnoyer et al., 2016). Impacts were observed on seven different taxa of octocorals, including Swiftia exserta, Hypnogorgia pendula, Thesea nivea, Paramuricea spp. and Placogorgia spp., as well as two taxa of antipatharian black corals (Silva et al., 2016, Etnoyer et al., 2016). At marked locations, the majority of colonies declined in health between 2011 and 2014, with only one colony showing signs of recovery (Etnoyer et al., 2016). The fish assemblage at these sites was also significantly different from the assemblage examined prior to the spill, with order-of-magnitude decreases in planktovorous fishes documented (Deepwater Horizon Natural Resource Damage Assessment Trustees, 2016).

To further investigate the causes of the impacts observed to the deep-sea corals, a series of lab oil and dispersant exposure experiments were carried out (DeLeo et al., 2016). Three species were examined: the octocorals Paramuricea sp. B3 (sister species to the deeper-living species impacted during the spill), Gorgonia ventalina, and a keratoisinid bamboo coral species (known to prefer habitats near natural seeps), and the black coral Leiopathes glaberrima. The corals were fragmented with replicates of the same colonies exposed to initial concentrations of 25 ppm, 7.9 ppm, and 0.8 ppm bulk additions of oil and dispersant in one experiment and 250 μm, 150 μm, and 50 μm initial, water-accommodated fractions in the other experiment. In all of the experiments, the corals showed minimal responses to oil exposures that did not differ from the controls, but rapid declines in health in the dispersant and dispersant plus oil treatments. It should also be noted that the oil:dispersant ratios on the corals at the impact site were less than 100:1 (White et al., 2014), while they were approximately 10:1 in these experiments (DeLeo et al., 2016). However, it was only with the addition of dispersant, which was recovered from the Paramuricea biscaya colonies exposed in the spill (White et al., 2014), that the impact phenotypes observed could be replicated in these laboratory experiments.

4.2. Microbiology

Hydrocarbon degrading microorganisms are distributed widely in the Gulf’s water column and sediments (Yang et al., 2016; Joye et al., 2014) which is not surprising given the amount of oil and gas that seeps naturally into the Gulf system each day (see above). The response of microbial communities to the DWH blowout has been detailed previously in a number of in-depth reviews (Atlas et al., 2015; Bik et al., 2012, Joye et al., 2014, 2016; Kimes et al., 2014; King et al., 2015). Here, we only summarize the key knowledge advances to date. Diverse deep-sea, cold adapted microorganisms responded rapidly, within hours to days (Hazan et al., 2010), to hydrocarbon exposure, revealing a remarkable metabolic potential of rare members of the in situ community (Kleindienst et al., 2015a, b). This bloom of previously rare microorganisms (Kleindienst et al., 2015a) shifted the microbial community to one dominated by hydrocarbon oxidizers and hydrocarbon oxidation activity increased impacting the Gulf’s particulate carbon cycle and
The timing and location of the Deepwater Horizon oil spill coincided with the spawning of many large pelagic fish species (Block et al., 2005, Grimes et al., 1990, Lang et al., 1994, Rooker et al., 2012, Teo et al., 2007). The Final Programmatic Damage Assessment and Restoration Plan (FDARP) estimates that between 2 and 5 trillion fish larvae were killed directly by the Deepwater Horizon spill. Furthermore, the foregone production associated with these losses was estimated to be in the order of 86 million to 122 million tons of fish, a significant impact on the Gulf of Mexico’s marine ecosystem.

Perhaps not surprisingly, evidence of circulatory problems like pericardial edema correlates well with early mortality events (Esbaugh et al., 2016). However, cardiotoxicity that does not lead to immediate mortality may impact long-term fitness and survival. Juvenile mahi-mahi raised in clean water for approximately 26 days after being exposed to oil for only 48 h during embryonic development showed substantial reductions in their ability to perform sustained high speed swimming likely as a result of abnormal development of the heart (Mager et al., 2014; Fig. 6). Sustained high speed swimming is likely important for predator avoidance, prey capture, migrations and spawning events suggesting that impaired swimming resulting from sublethal oil exposure may translate to reduced survival later in life. Impact of oil exposure on swimming performance is not limited to fish exposed during early development. Juvenile as well as young adult mahi-mahi also displayed reduced ability to sustain high swim speed following only 24 h of exposure immediately prior to swimming performance testing (Mager et al., 2014; Stieglitz et al., in press; Fig. 6). These observations of acute effects on later life stages cannot be explained by developmental defects and are, at least in the case of adult mahi-mahi, associated with a reduced ability to consume oxygen (Stieglitz et al., in press). Limitations in oxygen consumption can be attributed to reduced uptake at the gills or limitations in circulation of oxygenated blood to fuel the metabolically demanding activities such as swimming.

For adult mahi-mahi, low level oil exposure (ΣPAH < 8.4 µg l⁻¹) does not result in changes in gill morphology suggesting that the reduced maximal oxygen consumption is caused by reduced cardiac performance (Stieglitz et al., in press). In support of this suggestion of reduced cardiac performance in intact fish following even short-term exposure are observations of impact of oil exposure on the function of isolated cardiomyocytes. A study employing myocytes from yellowfin and bluefin tuna revealed that oil exposure impacted action potential duration, potassium and calcium transport in myocytes strongly supporting observations of reduced cardiac performance in intact fish following oil exposure (Brette et al., 2014). However, a direct link between oil exposures of intact animals, altered function of isolated myocytes and reduced swimming performance remains to be firmly established. In addition to effects on cardiac development and function, some observations suggest that other modes of action may also limit swimming performance. For juvenile mahi-mahi, reduced swimming performance despite sustained maximal oxygen uptake by oil exposed mahi-mahi implies that swimming efficiency may be compromised (Mager et al., 2014). Similarly, higher metabolic rates of oil exposed fish compared to controls at high swim speeds points to reduced swimming efficiency in young adult mahi-mahi (Stieglitz et al., in press).

At present, there is no empirical evidence for reduced survival or fitness of oil exposed mahi-mahi with reduced swimming performance. However, observations of reduced recapture of marked pink salmon exposed transiently as embryos before being released to the ocean suggests that oil induced cardiotoxicity may persist and cause population level effects (Heintz et al., 2000). Although compensatory mechanisms may be in place allowing fish exposed as embryos to survive despite alterations in cardiac function, fish are unlikely to recover from impaired cardiac function resulting from oil induced developmental effects. In contrast, the effects on swimming performance and cardiac function observed following short-term exposure to juvenile and adult mahi-mahi may be reversible after termination of exposure to oil. However, the scope for recovery of swimming performance following transient oil exposure of juvenile and adult fish has yet to be determined.

Although multiple studies have found oil spill-related injuries to fish stocks in the open ocean and coastal areas (Sumaila et al., 2014).
2012, Murawski et al., 2014), which resulted in significant economic losses, there are as yet no published findings concerning deep-sea fish stocks. The Gulf of Mexico deep sea ecosystem has hosted limited golden crab (Chaceon sp.) and deep-water long line operations (Wigley et al., 1975), but has not traditionally supported fisheries that approach the economic importance of brown shrimp, menhaden, or red snapper found at continental shelf depths. However, populations of large elasmobranchs are major predators that range from the outer continental shelf to the slope and potentially concentrate hydrocarbons through food chain effects and contribute to the general ecosystem services furnished by the deep-sea ecosystem (Levin and Sibuet, 2012).

Tarnecki and Patterson (2015) reported shifts in the diet of northern Gulf red snapper (Lutjanus campechanus) at natural and artificial reefs after the oil spill. Isotopic analysis of fish tissue δ13C, δ15N and δ34S indicated that the fish fed less on zooplankton and instead ingested more benthic prey with higher consumption of other (smaller) fish. Thus, following the oil spill, red snapper ate higher on the food chain (fish instead of zooplankton) and had a more benthic based diet, both of which would be expected to increase their mercury and petrocarbon content (Harper, 2016).

Murawski et al. (2014) examined pelagic fish populations in 2011–12 and observed that fish skin lesions were higher in 2011 relative to 2012. Incidence of lesions was greatest in bottom-living species, particularly tilefish and southern hake. Fish skin lesions were greatest among fish captured along the shelf edge north of the wellhead sites. Fish bile contained elevated concentration of the metabolites of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAH) in 2011, but these concentrations were reduced in 2012.

Harper (2016) hypothesized that the large input of organic matter from the oil spill could produce more reducing condition in the gulf sea floor (Hastings et al., 2016), which could increase the production of methyl-Hg, the more toxic form of Hg pollution. Across uniform coastal environments, higher methyl-Hg concentrations in three types of fish tissue were correlated with more reducing conditions using δ34S isotopic composition of the fish tissue as a proxy for reducing conditions (Harper, 2016). In addition, increased reliance on a more benthic diet was implicated in increased methyl-Hg in nearshore Gulf fish (Harper, 2016). Since Tarnecki and Patterson (2015) found that some reef fish consumed a more benthic diet following the spill it is reasonable that Harper (2016) found evidence for increased concentrations of methyl-Hg in porgy, grouper and cubbyu following the spill, consistent with her initial hypothesis.

5. Summary

The impacts of the Deepwater Horizon oil spill reached from the surface ocean to the seafloor in the Gulf of Mexico. This environmental disaster was, in effect, a large-scale accidental experiment from which the scientific community learned a great deal. The surprising distribution of oil and gas following the blowout, with 50% of the oil and 100% of the gas entrained in deep waters, made a comprehensive oil budget exceedingly difficult to assemble and underscored the need for quantifying the discharge rate throughout the incident so that the hydrocarbon influx can be tightly constrained. Similarly, a lack of widespread rate measurements of oil (and to some extent, gas) biodegradation rates left unbounded the degree to which biological oxidation served as a sink for discharged hydrocarbons. The discovery of sedimentation as a key fate for discharged oil can and should inform future response efforts, underscoring the need to quantify sedimentation rates across space and time; such data would help constrain the fate of oil and improve oil budgets.

Advances in Gulf physical oceanography over the past six years have been remarkable. We now have a much more detailed appreciation of fluid movements over a range of spatial and temporal scales and are in a stronger position to understand the movement of water – and associated hydrocarbons – should another offshore discharge occur. On-going efforts continue to advance and fine-tune circulation models to capture the dynamics of the Gulf system, with obvious and important implications for oil spill scenarios.

While it is clear that petrocarbon was incorporated into the Gulf’s food web, it is unclear how this incorporation occurred, whether by trophic transfer, accidental uptake, or sorption/uptake...
across cell or living surfaces (skin, membranes). While the impact of hydrocarbon exposure to the Gulf’s offshore biological communities was extensive, the damage could certainly have been much worse. Microbial communities responded rapidly to the hydrocarbon infusion, thanks largely to the existence of a low-abundance rare biosphere of microorganisms adept at hydrocarbon and dispersant biodegradation. Deepwater coral communities suffered widespread, negative impacts due to sedimenting marine oil snow. Dispersant exposure further damaged coral communities and may also impact their recovery. Fish populations in the Gulf, especially larvae of key game fish, exhibited a consistent pattern of cardiac impairment following oil/dispersant exposure. The long term impacts of oil exposure to fish populations are unknown but existing data suggest that a rigorous assessment of fishery-level impact(s) will require many more years of.

The Gulf of Mexico ecosystem contributes substantially to the Gulf coast and U.S. economy. Identifying and understanding the impacts of the Deepwater Horizon oil well blowout was impeded by the lack of baseline data for this critical ecosystem. In the future, it is absolutely essential to collect baseline data for systems that are at risk to be impacted by industrial activities. Without sufficient baseline data, it is nearly impossible to gauge and assign value to the ecosystem impacts resulting from large anthropogenic perturbations.

Acknowledgments

Funding for the development of this manuscript was provided by the Gulf of Mexico Research Initiative’s (GOMRI) RFP-IV program, including the “Ecosystem Impacts of Oil and Gas Inputs to the Gulf” (ECOGIG-2; S.B.J., A.B., J.P.C., I.R.M., E.E.C., J.P.M., and U.P.), the “Consortium for Advanced Research on Transport of Hydrocarbon in the Environment” (CARTHE; T.O.), and the “Relationships of Effects of Cardiac Outcomes in fish for Validation of Ecological Risk” (RECOVER; M.G.). This is ECOGIG contribution no. 440.

References
